



FAMILY SERVICES *of* PEEL

Since 1971

Gender, Migration and Identity Literature Review

**Peel Institute on Violence Prevention
Family Services of Peel**

30 November. 2020



An agency of the Government of Ontario
Un organisme du gouvernement de l'Ontario

Acknowledgement

Family Services of Peel - Peel Institute on Violence Prevention like to thank the following individuals for their contribution to prepare the literature review for the Gender, Migration and Identity project funded by the Ontario Trillium Foundation.

Monica Riutort	Manager, Peel Institute on Violence Prevention
Sarah Costantini,	Student, Gender Studies, University of Toronto-Mississauga Campus
Chandra Coomaraswamy	Research Assistant, Family Services of Peel

Acronyms

CSO	Civil Society Organizations
EOI	Express of Interest
FSP	Family Services of Peel
INGO's	International Non-Governmental Organizations
LCP	Live-In Caregiver Program
PIVP	Peel Institute on Violence Prevention
TFP	Temporary Foreign worker Program
UNO	United Nations Organization

Contents

INTRODUCTION	1
METHODOLOGY.....	2
IMMIGRATION POLICY IN CANADA	2
MOTHER-DAUGHTER RELATIONSHIP AND MIGRATION POLICY	4
MIGRATION	6
PUBLIC SPHERE	6
PRIVATE SPHERE.....	7
DIASPORA	7
ACCULTURATION	8
CULTURAL CONFLICT	8
VALUE TRANSMISSION.....	9
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	10
REFERENCES.....	12

INTRODUCTION

Migration is a complex and extremely life changing process that impacts all aspects of an immigrant's life, as well as the life of the family. For immigrants entering Canada, neo-colonial and capitalist ideologies govern the systems and structures that frame the immigration and acculturation process, which involves identity reformation and reconfiguration (Gastaldo, 2014). In the present study, we focus on the experience of women during the process of migration and adaptation. Women make up 48% of the population of international immigrants (United Nations, 2020). Gender roles and sexual behaviour of women are impacted differently within the migration process for women than for men (Espin, 1999). Moreover, the changing roles and status of women throughout the migration process have not been adequately studied (Espin, 1999).

Olivia Espin's (1999) book, *Women Crossing Boundaries: A Psychology of Immigration and Transformations of Sexuality* forms the basis of the study conducted by Peel Institute on Violence Prevention (PIVP). Espin (1999) takes a psychological approach in examining how cultural and sexual identity are developed and negotiated by immigrant and refugee women. Espin (1999) explores the understudied sphere of female migration and acculturation to understand how values surrounding gender roles and sexuality are impacted differently for women than they are for men. Espin (1999) highlights how the migration process allows women to "cross boundaries and transform their sexuality and sex roles" (5). This process is not smooth and is often filled with cultural conflicts occurring at the individual, familial and societal levels (Espin, 1999). Espin (1999) discusses how cultural and familial norms are often internalized. Immigrant communities often demand traditional gender role behaviours from migrant women. Such conflicts complicate the process of acculturation and can have major psychological effects on migrant women (Espin, 1999). Moreover, Espin (1999) explores the importance of language within the migration process, especially how language is related to sexuality. Espin (1999) illustrates the way in which language is deeply connected to cultural values surrounding sexuality and gender.

Espin's (1999) focus on how gender roles, sexuality and language are implicated within the migration and acculturation experiences of women is central to our study. Peel Institute on Violence Prevention (PIVP) focuses on ways in which gender roles and sexuality undergo changes within women's migration experiences. We examine the role that mothers play in the transmission of cultural values surrounding sexuality and gender roles to their daughters. Such a study is needed in the context of biographical erasure that shapes the migration journey of immigrants entering Canada (Gastaldo, 2014). Biographical erasure requires that the host country actively display indifference or ignorance toward the culture of immigrants, as well as requiring that immigrants respond by internalizing discourses of Canadian superiority (Gastaldo, 2014). Understanding the role of biographical erasure within the transmission of values across generations is important in recognizing how migrant women and their daughters transform their identities. Biographical erasure provides migrant women with the opportunity to reinvent themselves, while simultaneously oppressing them through the loss of cultural values and social connection. We want to understand how migrants navigate the maintaining of traditional values, in a space where they also experience oppression in relation to those same values. We want to know how mothers transmit certain cultural values to their daughters within this context.

The purpose of the literature review is (1) to examine how existing migration policies influence migrants' experience leaving their country of origin, entering a new country, and adapting to life in the host country, and (2) to examine the migration and acculturation experience of mothers and daughters, as revealed in the literature. Various factors at the micro-, meso-, and macro-levels play a role in how women experience migration and the subsequent process of adapting to life in Canada. We want to understand how gender, sexuality, language and the health of migrant mothers and daughters are implicated in relation to policies. This review aims to identify those whose experiences have been included and those who have been left out of the research. Based on the findings of the review, recommendations for future research will be made.

METHODOLOGY

Peel Institute on Violence Prevention (PIVP) conducted this literature review through keyword searches using multiple internet and academic search engines. Academic articles, working papers, books, and reports were searched through portals such as Sociological Abstracts, ProQuest, Google Scholar, the University of Toronto Library Database, and PsycINFO. Multiple search engines were used to ensure breadth of research and to be able to pull from various research disciplines.

IMMIGRATION POLICY IN CANADA

State sovereignty remains central in the migration policies of all immigrant-receiving countries (Gieger and Pecoud, 2014). In Canada, jurisdiction of immigration is formally shared by the federal government, and the provincial and territorial governments in the 1867 Canadian Constitution (Paquet, 2015). Canada used immigration for settlement and nation-building in the pre-World War II era, and the 1910 Immigration Act of Canada had a "preferred country" clause that gave preference to admitting immigrants from Western Europe, especially Britain (Akbari and MacDonald, 2014). Following World War II, Europe saw improved economic conditions, which led to a reduction in the rate of European immigration to North America. This resulted in labour shortages in Canada that threatened future economic activities. As a result, Canada adopted a migration policy based on human capital in 1962. This act eliminated the 'country preference' criterion and shifted to a universal migration policy. However, evidence-based research in Canada showed poor outcomes of the human capital approach. The poor outcomes were attributed to immigrants' language issues, skills and education recognition, or discrimination. Hence, immigration policy has become more sensitive to the economic outcomes of immigrants to Canada (Akbari and MacDonald, 2014).

Over the past two decades (1990-2010), Canadian bureaucrats have played a central role in initiating immigration and integration policymaking at the subnational level. As a result, more provincial participation has been brought into Canada's migration policy based on local labour market needs (Paquet, 2015). Due to increased provincial involvement in policy formation, policies that exist for migrants and refugees differ across Canada, creating variation in the experiences of immigrants. Such shared policy jurisdiction impacts migration management. The management of migration policies includes their development, such as who is involved, whose voices and needs are considered, and how they are

implemented. Shared jurisdiction can lead to fragmentation amongst policies, which in turn can lead to venue shopping (Geiger and Pecoud, 2014). Policymakers and bureaucrats shop around to find where they are most likely to have their policy accepted (Boucher, 2013; Geiger and Pecoud, 2014). Venue shopping has significant implications for those who migrate to Canada, as these policies impact the process of acculturation, access to services and the well-being of immigrants and their families. This process of venue shopping occurs in a bureaucratically controlled environment (Boucher, 2013), in which those with the most power, have the most say. Boucher (2013) argues that bureaucratic control over the process of policy formation shapes skilled immigration policies that result from this process. Skilled immigration policies are heavily steeped in economic criteria and a focus on satisfying Canadian labour market needs rather than on broader human capital measures and immigrant needs (Akbari and MacDonald, 2014).

Akbari and MacDonald (2014) argue that Canada has moved away from family class-based and human capital models of immigration, towards meeting specific labour market needs of the country in the last decade. Canada's immigration policy has been concentrated within three models in recent years. The first, is the **"Expression of Interest" (EOI) model**, where employers select immigrants to meet their business needs. The second is the **"Temporary Foreign Worker Programs (TFW)."** TFW programs address seasonal labour shortages and highly skilled areas. Canada was the second-highest recipient of temporary foreign workers per permanent resident. The third model is **"Attracting International Students."** International students are viewed as potential new immigrants. The Canadian government has adopted specific measures such as providing work permits, permanent residence under experience class, and the Provincial Nominee Program to retain international students after they complete their degrees (Akbari and MacDonald 2014). The focus on attracting international students is evident in the lack of recognition of foreign credentials. The lack of recognition of foreign credential leads to migrants ending up in precarious labour market positions that Canadian citizens do not want to take part in (Spitzer and Torres, 2008). These three migration models have reduced the focus on family-based immigration and increased the focus on economic contributions that may impose gender-specific restrictions and put women at a disadvantage (Akbari and MacDonald, 2014).

The role of civil society, specifically International Non-Governmental Organizations (INGOs), has been relatively limited in migration policy development. Most INGOs work on advocacy or operate in relation to migration. They mostly advocate for one aspect of migration, such as human trafficking or migrants' human rights. Advocacy rarely encompasses the whole migration policy field (Thouez, 2003). The Canadian government and other institutions would benefit greatly from considering INGO opinions and knowledge of INGOs, civil society groups, and other civil servants (Paquet, 2015; Thouez, 2003). This is especially important when it comes to the migration of women and girls. Women and girls are vulnerable in the migration process and need to be better protected under migration policies (Appleby and Kerwin, 2018). International organizations are increasingly developing their visions on how migration should be governed by receiving states. In some cases, they play a role in the design and implementation of migration policy (Geiger and Pecoud, 2010). There have been moves towards including INGOs and other actors in the policies (Geiger and Pecoud, 2010). Still, venue shopping often occurs here, as policy makers search for the INGOs whose values most closely align with their neoliberal and capitalist ideologies (Geiger and Pecoud, 2014). Geiger and Pecoud (2010) consider migration management as involving a range of practices and discourses surrounding what migration is and how to address it and increasing interventions from various actors. In 1996, the Government of Canada launched the International Metropolis Project

that brought together government officials, academic researchers, activists, and other civil stakeholders to work collaboratively on immigration and integration (Thouez, 2003). The International Metropolis Project (Thouez 2003) and the impact of activism relating to immigration policy (Paquet 2015), illustrates the importance of including all levels of government and other civic stakeholders to successfully manage migration.

A 2018 international migration policy report (Appleby and Kerwin, 2018) explains that governments have developed two Global Compacts to address the continuous flow of migrants under United Nation auspices. One is on refugees and the other is on “safe, orderly and regular migration” (Appleby and Kerwin, 2018). These agreements are nonbinding, aspirational documents intended to set the parameters of governmental and intergovernmental actions and policies for migration in the coming years. Both compacts were supposed to be adopted by the end of 2018. This Global Compact emphasizes the ‘vulnerable migrants’ and their challenges in the migration process, as well as the importance of faith-based organizations’ and INGOs’ involvement in supporting vulnerable migrants (Appleby and Kerwin, 2018). Such a report is important because it emphasizes women’s and girls’ experiences as they migrate, as well as how policies have had and continue to have severe ramifications on women and girls (Appleby and Kerwin, 2018). This migration policy report emphasizes that a paradigm shift is needed globally in migration policy. There needs to be a shift away from the ‘deterrence and enforcement model’ that is now in use and toward cooperation marked by responsibility sharing and increased legal avenues for migration that would reduce irregular migration. Appleby and Kerwin’s (2018) policy report states that if the Global Compact can achieve this shift, it would change migration governance for the better in the future.

Boucher (2013) argues that feminist and immigrant groups were able to oppose an “upskilling” immigration policy change at least partially in Canada, whereas Australia succeeded in changing this policy. Shields (2018) concludes that one way the Canadian government and non-profit organizations can achieve the goal of strengthening immigrant communities is by “expanding eligibility for settlement programming, offering pre-arrival services and ensuring that programming is appropriately targeted”. Such services will be beneficial to newcomers and their families who are navigating a new life and new cultural values. Tutty et al (2010), using a religious and cultural perspective, analyzed familial and intimate partner violence within immigrant families. Such a project illustrates the need to consider culture and religious perspectives within policies because values and beliefs differ amongst ethnicities. Strategies and policies engaged to end domestic violence in ethno-cultural communities can only be properly addressed by considering those specificities (Tutty et al., 2010).

MOTHER-DAUGHTER RELATIONSHIP AND MIGRATION POLICY

Research by Khosla (2003) found that immigrant women in Toronto, one of the most diverse cities in the world, are hardly even considered when it comes to decisions on community programs, policies, and spending priorities. Immigration policies that have existed, have failed to serve vulnerable groups, especially women. Khosla (2003) spoke with women to understand their opinions and views about public policy regarding migration and women of colour. Khosla’s (2003) research is beneficial but does not consider how the family relationship is impacted by policies. The impact of migration policies on the mother-daughter relationship remains under-researched in the literature. No papers or reports were

found that discussed how policies, such as the Live-in Caregiver Program, housing policies and policies regarding violence against women play a role in the mother-daughter relationship. Research does reveal some of the impacts on women and their families (e.g. Spitzer and Torres, 2008; Bernhard et al., 2005; Khosla, 2003), particularly when considering the transnational family.

There has been in existence multiple policies that have led to the creation of transnational families, in which the mother migrates to Canada to work and her children remain back home (Bernhard et al., 2005). It is within these policies that the gendered dimensions of migration begin to become apparent (Carling, 2005). For example, the Live-In Caregiver Program (LCP) policies only allowed for women to migrate, so many needing to find work migrated alone and left their children behind (Spitzer and Torres, 2008). Forced separation of women from their families, including their children, as a result of migration policies, is damaging to familial relations. These transnational households with immigrant mothers are commonly labeled “broken” homes (Spitzer and Torres, 2008). Long-term separation between parents and children has major psychological and traumatic impacts on mothers and children (Bernhard et al., 2005). Long-term separation, as a result of migration policies, of mothers and their children can create major tensions and even lead to loss of emotional connection (Foner and Dreby). While long-term separation often creates tension between mothers and their children, mothers’ lack of ability to manage their children’s externalizing behaviour issues similarly leads to familial tension. A study by Hiscock et al. (2005) evaluated parenting programs offered to mothers of toddlers in Australia with the goal of managing and preventing their children’s problematic behavioural issues. The study concluded that mothers who attended this program were less likely to report continuity of problematic behaviours in their children, thus improving mother-toddler relationships. Ultimately, improvements in the mother-toddler relationships can lead to good mother-daughter relationships later on.

Some migrant women are forced to remain with abusive employers to reduce the amount of time they are separated from their families and to avoid deportation (Spitzer and Torres, 2008). Bhuyan et al. (2014) discusses Canadian immigration policies and their impact on violence against women. If migrant women under the LCP program are forced to remain with abusive employers to be able to stay in the country, such a program is reinforcing violence against women. The violence these policies perpetuate is not just physical, but also economic, psychological, and emotional (Bhuyan et al., 2014). Policies forcing familial separation are a form of psychological and emotional violence, and policies that do not recognize foreign education or provide affordable housing are a form of economic violence within Bhuyan et al.’s (2014) feminist analysis.

Policies regarding housing and economic positioning of migrants have also impacted migrant women and their families. Migrant women are at risk for poverty, and poverty has major implications for the well-being of mothers and children (Khosla, 2003). Poverty of migrant women is tied to labour market access and access to housing. Hadi and Labonte (2012) found that housing became less accessible for new low-income immigrant families due to policy shifts regarding inclusion criteria between 1991 and 2010. From this report, it is apparent that access to adequate housing is related to other social determinants of health including income, employment, family size, language, and ethnic origin (Hadi and Labonte, 2012). By looking at Canadian policies in relation to social determinants of health connected to migrant housing, it becomes clear that the focus of such policies remains set in neoliberalism and capitalism, rather than on the needs of newcomers. The rights and needs of women and their families are not considered. Such

exclusion for adequate housing, under Bhuyen et al.'s (2014) feminist analysis, can be considered as a part of the spectrum of violence against women. Housing and employment policies impact the health of migrants, but what remains unclear is how the mother-daughter relationship is influenced by inadequate housing and poverty.

The process of adapting to life in a new country is difficult and deeply affected by the current policy environment (Phillimore, 2011). Migrant health, including physical and mental health, family health, and economic health are all impacted by the policies that exist regarding migration. Shields (2018) identified resilience as a main factor in determining the success or failure of new migrants settling in Canada. This resilience occurs at both the level of the immigrant and at the institutional level (Shields, 2018). But as can be gleaned from the literature review above, resilience on the part of immigrants is not always enough, as other barriers embedded within policies exist as well. Within the current policy environment, refugees and migrants lack choice in their acculturation strategy, are vulnerable to psycho-social stress and struggle to integrate (Phillimore, 2011). Policies that remain focused on neoliberal and capitalist ideologies do not meet the needs of migrant women and their families. A major gap remains in the research regarding mother-daughter relationships. Filling this gap can help gain a better understanding of how policies influence relationships, cultural value-transmission, the impact of transnational separation and the health of migrant mothers and daughters as they adapt to their new home.

MIGRATION

The theme of migration is quite broad and encompasses many varying aspects of the process of moving from one country or region to another. The literature illustrates that women are influenced to migrate and experience migration in highly complex forms, and that the process differs for men. Thus, migration is a highly gendered process. Reasons for women to migrate include marriage, work, family, and violent or poor conditions of their home country (Ghosh, 2009; Espin, 1999). Within the literature reviewed, findings can be spilt into two categories: the private sphere and the public sphere. The public and private spheres are connected; they cannot be viewed in complete isolation from one another. Analyzing them as two categories allows for understanding how they are interrelated, as well as how they influence migrant women in different ways. The private sphere refers to women's experience of migration relating to family relations, and personal social support networks. The public sphere refers to women's migration as it relates to their position and experiences in the labour market.

PUBLIC SPHERE

A major reason for women choosing to migrate is for work (Ambramovich et al., 2011; Ghosh, 2009; Hondagneau-Sotelo, 2003). When women migrate for work, they most often end up in the informal economy (Chant & Pedwell, 2008; Dayton-Johnson et al., 2007). This has important implications for migrant women, as it impacts class status, gender roles, and family relations. Migrant women still experience patriarchal constraints, but often find jobs faster in their host country than men, and even find themselves bringing in more income than migrant men (Hondagneau-Sotelo, 2003). This finding is important when considering gender roles. Women may find their move into the Western labour market empowering, as they experience new opportunities they otherwise would never have encountered. The sending of remittances back home is also gendered. It is often women from poorer households who migrate and then send money back home (Curran & Saguy, 2011). In some cases, women may become

the sole provider for their family, whether their family has migrated with them or they have migrated alone with the plan to send money back home. Women come to hold the position that is reserved for men in the patriarchal hierarchy, and this changes how women view themselves, how they raise their children, and how they relate to their families. Although women may experience changing gender roles from their move into the labour market, it remains important to recognize the struggles they face. Migrant women in the informal economy experience precariousness in their jobs and may have formal education that is not recognized in their host country (Cerutti, 2009; Chant & Pedwell, 2008; Dayton-Johnson et al., 2007). They may also experience gendered violence in relation to their new position within society, as it challenges the traditional family comfort level.

PRIVATE SPHERE

As indicated in the discussion of the public sphere, women's positions in the labour market can influence relations in the home, particularly when migrant women come to hold the position of provider. This can change how husbands and wives interact. As gender roles change, and men and women adjust to their new lives, men can be seen taking on more housework after migrating (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2003). Motherhood is impacted by the migration experience as well (Cerutti, 2009; Espin, 1999). The role of mothers shifts, as they enter the labour market, often for the first time, reducing time spent with their children. Mothers and children are also impacted by changing value systems, especially as children enter the school system in the host country. The impact of mother and child relations will be discussed in more detail in the acculturation section. Social support networks are also extremely important for women in the migration process, as it helps facilitate their adjustment and reduce risks (Curran & Saguy, 2011). The literature reviewed here did not focus heavily on the negative effects of familial relations. It would be beneficial to understand how changes in the family system, as a result of migration, may hurt women and family relations.

Migration is a complex process for women, as they navigate their reasons for migrating, the labour market, changes in gender roles, and more. Migration impacts all facets of a woman's life and is not limited to what has been discussed in this review. The literature could benefit from a deeper look into the connections between a woman's place in the labour market and her relations within her family. The literature could also benefit from a deeper understanding of changing gender roles of migrant women and violence within the family.

DIASPORA

The term diaspora has become broadly used within the literature (Brubaker, 2005). Diaspora involves the spreading of peoples across time and space. Inherent in this process, is the mixing and intermingling of cultures, histories, values, and systems transnationally. The literature reveals how diaspora operates at macro-, micro-, and meso-levels and connects nations together through sharing of cultures. As people and groups migrate, they must re-negotiate the boundaries surrounding their cultural values as they encounter new and often extremely different value systems (Brubaker, 2005). Literature shows that migrants create multiple relations to the states in which they live (Baker-Cristales, 2004). Migrants must work within those differing cultures to construct their identities, and this has major implications for gender roles, familial relations, and other social structures. These cultural changes occur within dating and marital relationships, family relations, social relations, and gender roles (Angelo, 1997). Such findings illustrate micro-level changes and cultural interactions. The nation state is important for the way that migrants construct their individual and social identities (Baker-Cristales, 2004). The literature

also reveals how growing ethnic diversity that results from migration impacts economies, political institutions, cultures, and citizenship, demonstrating cultural changes occurring at the macro-level as well (Castles & Miller, 1998). Another macro-level factor to consider is colonial processes that have occurred throughout the world and influence how migrants go about moving to a new country, adapting to the culture and how society views migrants (Bates, 2001).

The literature centering on diaspora also indicates how migrants go about maintaining certain aspects of their culture. Traditional cultural values are often maintained through religious observances (Angelo, 1997). Connecting to social networks of shared colonial histories and cultural histories also helps in the maintenance of traditional cultural values and practices (Brubaker, 2005; Bates, 2001).

ACCULTURATION

Acculturation is a bi-directional process, involving the interplay of cultures. That is, the adaption to the new environment involves a negotiation between differing value and cultural systems. The immigrant or refugee does not simply adapt to the culture of the host country but negotiates between their traditional culture and the new culture. Acculturation is also multi-dimensional. Factors from the macro-, meso-, and micro-levels all influence acculturation. Much of the research on acculturation focuses on acculturation within the family, particularly between mothers and daughters. There are two overarching themes that arose within the acculturation literature: (1) cultural conflict, and (2) value transmission. These themes are not mutually exclusive, rather they are deeply intertwined. However, separating them allows for a better analysis of how they appear in existing literature and influence acculturation.

CULTURAL CONFLICT

The acculturative process for migrant women involves multiple forms of conflict, occurring at various levels. The literature reveals various types of conflict, why conflict occurs and outcomes of acculturation conflict. Areas revealed in the literature where high levels of conflict are seen are in sexual identity and behavior, gender roles, and language (Bacchus, 2017; Rashidian et al., 2013; Usita & Blieszner, 2012; Carranza, 2012). These areas of conflict are not exhaustive but are the areas that appeared most often in this review. The literature reveals reasoning for cultural conflict, including differing levels of acculturation within the family, competing value systems and differing levels of immersion within those value systems, and internalized values (Salami et al., 2020; Wang-Schweig & Miller, 2018; Bacchus, 2017; Cook & Waite, 2016; Rashidian et al., 2013; Carranza, 2012).

Sexual behavior and gender roles are areas where there often exist high levels of acculturative conflict (Bacchus, 2017; Rashidian et al., 2013; Carranza, 2013; 2012). Conflict around sexuality occurs at both the interpersonal and intrapersonal level. At the interpersonal level, conflict relating to sexual values often occurs between immigrant mothers and daughters (Bacchus, 2017). In the majority of the studies reviewed, children of immigrants had been raised primarily within the host country, and thus had spent most of their lives immersed in mainstream values of that country. Immigrant parents often surveille their adolescent children's sexual behavior and implement high levels of control over who their children can be friends with and spend time with (Bacchus, 2017). There tends to be high value placed on chastity and modesty by mothers (Bacchus, 2017; Carranza, 2013; 2012). Mothers are from cultures where virginity of girls is extremely important. This contrasts strongly to mainstream values that exist in Western cultures that demonstrate increased leniency towards sexual behavior (Verduzco, 2016). These conflicting cultural values surrounding sexuality often lead to daughters hiding their sexual behaviors from their immigrant mothers. Even at marital age, South Asian America women reported that they avoid speaking to their

mothers about their sexual activity, due to their mothers' strong connection to their traditional values (Bacchus, 2017).

At the intrapersonal level, conflict surrounding sexual values and gender roles occurs between individual women and their internalized values (Rashdian et al., 2013). The acculturative process involves a re-definition of a woman's sexual self, as they come to a new country that holds different values surrounding sexuality and gender (Rashdian et al., 2013). This involves conflict between values and norms that women have internalized throughout their lives surrounded by their traditional culture. Rashdian et al. (2013) found that for Iranian American women, there are often high levels of guilt and shame connected to this value transformation, as internalized cultural values come into conflict with Western values and morals surrounding sex and gender. This finding, based on Iranian American women, will most likely exist for other groups of immigrant women as well. Further research would be beneficial. It would create a better understanding of internal conflicts in other immigrant groups, relating to sexual values and values other than sexuality and gender.

Language was also revealed as an area in which acculturation conflict occurs (Usita & Blieszner, 2002; Espin, 1999). Language creates barriers between immigrants and society, as well as between immigrants and their children who have been raised in Western culture. There are power relations related to language (Espin, 1999). A parent's lack of fluency in the host country's language and the children's lack of fluency in their parents' first language can lead to separation between parent and child. It can also result in children ignoring the authority of parents and parents having to rely on their children for support in navigating life in the host country (Usita & Blieszner, 2002; Espin 1999).

The cultural conflict leads to various outcomes, including mental health consequences, conflict resolution and divisions between immigrant parents and their children (Bacchus, 2017; Lawton et al., 2017; Carranza, 2013; 2012; Varghese & Jenkins, 2009; Nauck, 2001). The literature reveals mental health as an area in which immigrants, as well as their children, are often majorly impacted. The process of acculturation involves psychological reorganization, as individuals and families negotiate and reconfigure their identities and relationships amongst competing and changing value systems (Espin, 1999). Acculturation conflict has significant effects on mental health for both parents and adolescents (Lawton et al., 2017; Varghese & Jenkins, 2009). Research also reveals a strong association between generational status, maternal control, and depression (Varghese & Jenkins, 2009). Second-generation Asian Indian women who reported that their mothers were over-protective and controlling of their daily life reported higher levels of depressive symptoms and lower levels of self-esteem (Varghese & Jenkins, 2009). When daughters experienced high levels of control, they also reported higher levels of cultural value conflict, which increases vulnerability to depression (Lawton et al., 2017; Varghese & Jenkins, 2009). Parents' and children's mental health is impacted differently, but the exact reasoning for this difference is unclear and requires more research to better understand (Lawton et al., 2017; Varghese & Jenkins, 2009).

The research also indicates that cultural conflict can be reduced by certain factors. When families have strong family ties and shared understanding of cultural differences, even though they may have differing values, they have reduced levels of conflict. Over time, and as parents and children work through the process of acculturation, levels of conflict decrease.

VALUE TRANSMISSION

The transmission of values across generations is the second major theme that arises from acculturation-focused literature. The process of migration changes the way that values are transmitted across generations. Parents and children are often raised in environments that promote differing values. Cultural conflict is deeply embedded within the process of value transmission, as parents and children navigate competing cultural values. Parenting style and familial relations are implicated in the value transmission process (Salami et al., 2020; Afrin et al., 2019; Cook & Waite, 2016; Carranza, 2013; Nauck, 2001). The transmission of sexual values appears often in this literature (Verduzco, 2016; Carranza, 2013; Townsend, 2008). Mothers are of particular importance in the process of value transmission (Cook & Waite, 2016; Carranza, 2013; 2012, Townsend, 2008).

When parents want to instill traditional values in their children, they take on more controlling styles of parenting (Afrin et al., 2019). That is not to say that these parents do not want their children to adapt to the values of the host country. There are certain values, however, that parents hold as necessary to instill in their children that are contradictory to what their children are exposed to outside of the home. To ensure they can instill these traditional values, they must remain watchful and often promote mistrust in their parenting practices (Afrin et al., 2019). The area that parents maintain the most control over is sexual value transmission (Carranza, 2013; 2012). Immigrant parents are often from cultures that value chastity and virginity of girls, and thus, work to instill these values in their daughters. However, even though mothers place high valuation on chastity, they often promote contradictory messaging (Townsend, 2008; Espin, 1999). This is seen at times in the differing actions of mothers from what they explicitly tell their daughters (Townsend, 2008).

Verduzco (2016) highlights two discourses that are implicated in the transmission of sexual values. The first is a disembodied view, where mothers promote virginity and the expectation that their daughters show zero interest in sex until they are married (Verduzco, 2016). Here, sex becomes something dirty and a subject in which women should not show interest until marriage. In this view, sex and sexual identity are seen as taboo topics that are not to be discussed by women. The second is an embodied view, where mothers focus on sex in relation to love and connection, but still focus on sex within marriage (Verduzco, 2016). In the second view, mothers can be seen to have undergone a value shift themselves, as they move away from promoting that sex is bad and dirty, and instead associate it with love, although still in the context of marriage.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The literature reveals many policies existing in a Canadian context and their implications for migrants. Canada's immigration policies have evolved from a nation-building, human capital approach to current policies that focus heavily on Canada's local labour market and economic needs. They often do not include the voices of immigrants or INGOs. When the voices of INGOs are considered, policy makers shop around for the INGO with values most closely aligned to their own. Recently, INGOs have been developing a stronger position within immigration policy. Appleby and Kerwin's (2018) policy report states that if the Global Compact can achieve the shift toward cooperation amongst policymakers, INGOs and other civil society organizations, it would change migration governance for the better in the future.

Migration policies are especially important to be considered, with respect to the most vulnerable groups. Immigrant women are hardly taken into account when it comes to policy and service development and implementation. Studies on immigration policy do not address the mother-daughter relationship in

connection with policies. When considering immigrant health and identity formation, familial relations must be accounted for. Studies have commonly considered the family context, but not the more intricate details and impacts on specific relations within the family and intergenerational relations. Understanding generational relations is particularly important because the impact of policies change, as cultural values shift and transform within the mother-daughter relationship. Future research will benefit from taking a gendered and intergenerational approach to the analysis of policy formation and implementation.

Further, the literature reveals the complexity of the migration and acculturation process. Changes occur at multiple levels and have various outcomes that impact the lives of women. When looking at literature that focuses on the theme of migration, two subthemes emerge. Migration impacts women in both the public and private spheres. It is important to note that these spheres are not separate; rather, they are closely connected, as factors from one influence the other and vice versa. Research reveals that when it comes to changes in gender roles during migration, they impact women differently in the labour market than in the home environment. It is important to understand these differences, because they often vary from a migrant woman's experience in her homeland. A gap that became apparent within this literature is that there are few connections made between the labour market positioning of women and their position in the home. There is mention that migrant women's experience in the public sphere has implications for motherhood and spousal relationships, but what exactly those implications are, is not clear. Future research could benefit from a focus on this aspect.

Literature on diaspora reveals how the process of dispersion, the establishment of cultural boundaries and cultural maintenance occurs at the micro-, meso-, and macro-levels. The crossing of cultural boundaries connects heavily to Espin's (1999) work. The research reveals how cultures interact and new cultural borders are created. Future research would benefit from considering the crossing of cultural boundaries regarding gender roles and sexuality. Espin (1999) highlights the importance of such boundary crossing for women. Thus, it would be beneficial to consider how sexual and gender boundaries are navigated by women at the micro-, meso-, and macro-levels.

In the literature focused on the acculturation process, cultural conflict and value transmission are prominent. Sexual behaviour and identity and gender roles are particular areas where high levels of value conflict and value transmission occur. When it comes to value transmission, conflict is inherent in the process, as children navigate values transmitted to them by their mothers, as well as values imparted through mainstream culture. The process of acculturation is extremely complex and involves many dimensions and factors. Cultural conflict is especially important to consider in its relation to mental health outcomes. The literature indicates strong associations between mental health difficulties and high levels of conflict. Areas within acculturation that could benefit from further research are internalized cultural conflict and language acculturation. Research would further an understanding as to how internalized norms in areas other than sexuality are impacted through the adaptation process. Language is extremely connected to cultural norms (Espin, 1999), so it is important to develop a deeper understanding of how it is implicated in the acculturation process.

REFERENCES

- Abkari A. H., & MacDonald M. (2014). Immigration policy in Australia, New Zealand, and the United States: An Overview of Recent Trends. *International Migration Review*, 48(3), 801-822. Doi:10.1111/imre.12128
- Abramovich, V., Cernadas, P.C., and Morlachetti, A. (2011). The Rights of Children, Youth, and Women in the Context of Migration: Conceptual Basis and Principles for Effective Policies with a Human Rights and Gender Based Approach. Social and Economic Policy Working Paper. New York: UNICEF.
- Afrin, S., Chenhall, R.D., & Vaughn, C. (2019). I Wish for My Daughters to Remain Under My 'Wings': An Exploration of Bangladeshi Immigrant Mothers' Socialization Process of Raising Adolescent Daughters in Melbourne, Australia. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 50(2), 162-182.
- Angelo, M. (1997). The Sikh Diaspora: Tradition and Change in an Immigrant Community. New York, Garland Pub.
- Appleby, J. & Kerwin, D. (2018). *2018 International Migration Policy Report: Perspectives on the Content and Implementation of the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly, and Regular Migration*. New York: Scalabrini Migration Studies Centers. <https://doi.org/10.14240/internationalmigrationrpt2018>
- Bacchus, N. S. (2017). Shifting Sexual Boundaries: Ethnicity and Pre-Marital Sex in the Lives of South Asian American Women. *Sexuality & Culture* 21, 776-794, doi:10.1007/s12119-9421-2
- Baker-Cristales, B. (2004). Salvadoran Migration to Southern California: Redefining el hermano Lejano. Gainesville, FL, University of Florida Press.
- Bates, C. (2001). Community, Empire, and Migration: South Asians in Diaspora. New York, N.Y., Palgrave. <http://www.loc.gov/catdir/description/hol051/00033318.html>
- Bernhard, J. K., Landholt, P., & Goldring, L. (2005). Transnational Multi-Local Motherhood: Experiences of Separation and Reunification among Latin American Families in Canada. (CERIS Working Paper No. 40).
- Bhuyan, R., Osborne, B., Zahraei, S., & Tarshis, S. (2014). *Unprotected, Unrecognized: Canadian Immigration Policy and Violence Against Women, 2008-2013*. Migrant Mothers Project.
- Boucher, Anna. (2013) Bureaucratic Control and Policy Change: A Comparative Venue Shopping Approach to Skilled Immigration Policies in Australia and Canada. *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, 15(4), 349-367. Doi:10.1080/13876988.2012.749099.
- Brubaker, R. (2005). "The 'Diaspora' Diaspora." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(1), 1-19.

- Carranza, M. E. (2013). Value Transmission Among Salvadorian Mothers and Daughters: Marianismo and Sexuality Morality. *Child Adolescent Social Work Journal*, 30, 311-327. Doi:10.1007/s10560-012-0291-z
- Carranza, M. E. (2012). Salvadorian Ethnic Pride: A Bridge for Reducing Mother-Daughter Conflict Due to Acculturation into Canadian Society. *Canadian Social Work Review*, 29(1), 61-85.
- Castles, S., and M. J. Miller (1998). *The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World*. New York, Guilford Press.
<http://www.loc.gov/catdir/description/guilford051/98016000.html>
- Cerutti, M. (2009). Gender and Intra-Regional Migration in South America. Human Development Research Paper No. 12. New York: United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report Office.
- Chant, S., and Pedwell, C. (2008). *Women, gender, and the informal economy: An assessment of ILO research and suggested ways forward*. Geneva: London School of Economics and ILO.
- Charsely, K. (2005). "Unhappy Husbands: Masculinity and Migration in Transnational Pakistani Marriages." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 11(1): 85
- Cook, J. & Waite, L. (2016). 'I think I'm more free with them' – Conflict, Negotiation and Change in Intergenerational Relations in African Families Living in Britain. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 42(8), 1388-1402
- Curran, S. R., and Saguy, A.C. (2011). Migration and Cultural Change: A Role for Gender and Social Networks? *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 2(3), 389-410.
- Dayton-Johnson, J., Katseli, L.T., Maniatis, G., Munz, R., Papademetriou, D. (2007). *Gaining from Migration: Towards a New Mobility System*. Paris: Development Centre of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
- Espín, O. (1999). *Women Crossing Boundaries: A psychology of immigration and transformations of sexuality*. New York: Routledge.
- Foner, N., & Dreby, J. (2011). Relations between the Generations in Immigrant Families. *The Annual Review of Sociology*, 37, 545-564. Doi: 10.1017/S0047279410000929
- Gastaldo, D. (2014). Biographical Erasure as Oppression. *Journal of Critical Anti-Oppressive Social Inquiry*, 1(1).
- Geiger, M., & Pecoud, A. (2010). The Politics of International Migration Management. In Geiger, M., & Pecoud, A. (eds). *The Politics of International Migration Management*. (1-20). London: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230294882_1
- Geiger, M. & Pécoud, A. (2014) International Organisations and the Politics of Migration. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 40(6), 865-887, DOI:10.1080/1369183X.2013.855071

Ghosh, J. (2009). Migration and gender empowerment: Recent trends and emerging issues. Human Development Research Paper No. 04. New York: United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report Office.

Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM). *Gender Dimensions of International Migration*

Hadi, A., & Labonté, R. (2012). Housing and health of recent immigrants in Canada: A narrative review. Population Health Improvement Research Network.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P, ed. (2003). Gender and Immigration: A Retrospective and Introduction. In Gender and US Immigration: Contemporary Trends. University of California Press.

Khosla, P. (2003). If low income women of colour counted in Toronto. Toronto: Community Social Planning Council of Toronto.

Lawton, K. E., Gerdes, A. C., & Kapke, T. (2017). The Role of Acculturation Differences and Acculturation Conflict in Latino Family Mental Health. *Journal of Latina/o Psychology*, 6(2), 94-114, doi:10.1037/lat0000084

Murray, M. (2005). The International Journal of Mental Health Promotion: Promoting Mental Health Preventing Mental Disorders, Volume 7, Issue 2.

Nauck, B. (2001). Intercultural Contact and Intergenerational Transmission in Immigrant Families. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 32(2), 159-173.

Phillimore, J. (2011). Refugees, Acculturation Strategies, Stress, and Integration. *Journal of Social Policy*, 40, 575-593 doi:10.1017/S0047279410000929

Rashidian, M., Hussain, R., & Minichiello, V. (2013). 'My culture haunts me no matter where I go': Iranian American women discussing sexual and acculturation experiences. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 15(7), 866-877. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13691058.2013.78128>

Salami, B., Alaazi, D. A., Yohani, S., Valliantos, H., Okeke-Ihejirika, P., Ayalew, T., & Nsaliwa, C. (2020). Parent-Child Relationships Among African Immigrant Families in Canada. *Family Relations* 69(4), 743-755, doi:10.1111/fare.12454

Shields, J. (2018). *Immigrant Settlement Agencies in Canada: A Critical Review of the Literature through the Lens of Resilience*. Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. <https://bmrc-irmu.info.yorku.ca/files/2018/10/ISAs-A-Critical-Review-2018-JSRB-edits-Oct-9-2018.pdf>

Spitzer, D., & Torres, S. (2008). Gender-based barriers to settlement and integration for live-in caregivers: A review of the literature (CERIS Working Paper No. 71). Retrieved from CERIS website: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-621-x/89-621-x2007005-eng.pdf>.

- Thouez, Colleen. The Role of Civil Society in Shaping International Migration Policy, October 2003, The United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), New York
- Townsend, T. G. (2008). Protecting Our Daughters: Intersection of Race, Class and Gender in African American Mothers' Socialization of Their Daughters' heterosexuality. *Sex Roles* 59, 429-442
- Tutty, L. M., Giurgiu, B., Traya, N., Weaver-Dunlop, J., & Christensen, J. (2010). Promising practices to engage ethno-cultural communities in ending domestic violence. RESOLVE, University of Calgary.
- UN Migration. (2020). *World Migration Report 2020*.
https://www.un.org/sites/un2.un.org/files/wmr_2020.pdf
- Usita, P. M. & Blieszner, R. (2002). Immigrant Family Strengths: Meeting Communication Challenges. *Journal of Family Issues* 23(2), 266-286
- Wang-Schweig, M., & Miller, B. A. (2018). Examining the Interdependence of Parent-adolescent Acculturation Gaps on Acculturation-based Conflict: Using the Actor-Partner Interdependence Model. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*. Doi:10.1007/s10964-018-0948-9
- Varghese, A. & Jenkins, S. R. (2009). Parental Overprotection, Cultural Value Conflict and Psychological Adaptation among Asian Indian Women in America. *Sex Roles* 61, 235-251, doi:10.1007/s11199-009-9620-x
- Verduzco Reyes, Daisy. (2016). Conundrums of Desire: Sexual Discourses of Mexican-Origin Mothers. *Sexuality & Culture* 20, 1020-1041